Appendix A

Public Participation

Table of Contents

A Public Participation 1
A.1 Housing Element Project Website 1
A.2 Outreach and Notification 1
A.2.1 Project Notification List 2
A.2.2 Digital and Printed Notices 2
A.3 Summary Video 2
A.4 Pop-Up Events 3
A.5 Community Workshops 3
A.6 Town Hall Meetings 5
A.7 Interviews with Interested Parties 6
Equity Advisory Committee Meetings 7
A.8 Surveys 10
A.8.1 Housing Needs Survey 10
A.8.2 Site Inventory Survey 11
A.8.3 Housing Element Micro-Survey 11
A.9 Planning Commission Study Session 11
A.10 Themes In Community Outreach Input 11
A.11 Public Review of the Draft Housing Element 16

Tables

Table A-1 Summary of Community Input and Responses 12
Table A-2 Summary of Public Review Comments and Responses 17
Table A-3 Summary of Public Review Comments and Responses (Revised Draft) 20

This page intentionally left blank.

A Public Participation

The Housing Element must reflect the values and preferences of the community. Accordingly, community participation is an important component of the development of this Element. Government Code Section 65583(c)(8) states that the local government must make "a diligent effort to achieve public participation of all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element." This process not only includes community members, but also participation from local agencies and housing groups, community organizations, and housing developers.

During the development of the Housing Element update, direct input was received from more than 30 individuals and organizations, which was crucial in shaping the priorities and objectives for the Housing Element update. Input was received from individuals and organizations that serve special needs households and renters, represent First Nation tribes, develop and manage affordable housing, and offer fair housing services.

Madera County provided online and in-person opportunities for interested parties and community members to provide input throughout the development of the Housing Element. Input was gathered through interviews, community surveys on housing needs and the Site Inventory, a project-specific website, information booths at community events, the Equity Advisory Committee, project-specific public meetings, a Planning Commission meeting, and other methods as described in this document. Themes from community input and how the Housing Element update incorporated that input is provided in the tables at the end of this document.

A.1 Housing Element Project Website

A project website dedicated to the Housing Element was created to keep the community informed throughout the update process.

https://maderacountyhousingelement.com.

The website provided detailed information on the Housing Element process, frequently asked questions, project updates, summaries of past events, the housing and Site Inventory surveys, and copies of the Site Inventory and Draft Housing Element update. Project materials associated with the Housing Element update were regularly posted on the project website, including flyers for upcoming workshops and workshop PowerPoint presentations. A link on the website enabled people to sign up for project email updates and to submit comments throughout the project process.

A.2 Outreach and Notification

To inform the public of project milestones and opportunities for involvement during the Housing Element update process, the County notified community members and interested parties on project updates, upcoming workshops, and engagement opportunities through a combination of digital and traditional outreach methods.

A.2.1 Project Notification List

The project notification list included 97 ~~96~~ organizations and individuals who received emails about project milestones and opportunities for involvement. The complete notification list is provided as an attachment to this appendix.

A.2.2 Digital and Printed Notices

The County distributed mailer notices and printed flyers in English and Spanish. Digital material and reminders were sent out via email to the project email list, posted on the project website, and advertised on social media via the County's channels and platforms, including Facebook, Instagram, and Twitter (now known as X). The following outreach methods were used to inform the community on opportunities for involvement in the Housing Element update process:

- All outreach events and participation opportunities were advertised on the County's website and posted on the Housing Element update website.
- Printed flyers were made available at the Madera County Government Center to advertise the community workshops, Planning Commission study session, and other engagement opportunities.
- Printed flyers were distributed at community events, including the Fairmead, Parksdale, and La Vina Community meetings, the City of Madera Farmers Market, and the Oakhurst Community Health Fair.
- Digital flyers were distributed through the County's social media outlets, including Facebook, Instagram and Twitter (now known as X).
- Direct mailers in English and Spanish were sent to 11,000 residents of identified Disadvantaged Communities (DACs) with limited broadband access to inform them of the Housing Element public review period. DACs are considered areas with concentrated populations of low-income households, high unemployment rates, low levels of homeownership, overpayment on rent, sensitive populations, pollution burdened, or low levels of educational attainment as identified by the CalEnviroScreen mapping tool. Further discussion and analysis on DACs in the county are included in Appendix F, *Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing*.

County agencies and community organizations, including the Madera County Department of Public Health, Leadership Counsel for Justice & Accountability, and Community Action Partnership of Madera County, helped spread awareness of the Housing Element update throughout the process by disseminating email updates and printed flyers and event notices to their contact lists.

A.3 Summary Video

The County published a Housing Element video on the County website on August 2, 2024, to summarize the Housing Element. Throughout the Housing Element process, the public noted that the document was lengthy and technical, which deterred people from reviewing. The video simplified the document by providing an overview of the main housing issues faced by County residents, listing the five goals addressed in the Housing Plan, and describing the implementable programs and actions the County plans to take. The video was translated into Spanish and advertised on the County's various social media platforms and emailed to the interested parties list.

The video included discussion questions to guide viewers in providing feedback on the Housing Element. Two comments were received by the public:

- I really appreciate the video that summarizes the Madera County Housing Element website to assist with the "lengthy and technical" Housing Element information. Of course, I could only scan through the lengthy documents at first glance but found it was easy to somewhat zero in with questions and concerns I have regarding our Fairmead community on the easy-to-use website.
- I believe Madera needs not only affordable housing but apartments that have shorter wait listing times. Earlier this year I was left almost homeless with my 1 year old daughter because every apartment her father and I applied to had a wait list of about 2-3 years. Public housing and section 8 were also backed up a couple years. If it wasn't for a miracle of getting a call back from 1 apartment complex out of all the many we had applied to, we would of been on the street. Housing is a serious issue here in Madera please make it so young couples with kids can survive out here too. I am a new mother and I have never been more scared in my life then when I was met with this reality. We cannot afford to be paying thousands of dollars on rent we are seriously struggling.

The Housing Element website does not provide viewer count for the video itself; however, viewer count for the website since the release of the video was higher than previous months. Graphs depicting these results are attached at the end of this chapter.

~~A.3~~A.4Pop--Up Events

County staff attended local community events to inform residents of the Housing Element update, receive input on the Site Inventory, and answer questions regarding the update process. At these events, community members were encouraged to sign up for email updates, participate in the housing and/or Site Inventory surveys, and provide input on housing issues and priorities in the county. Staff attended the following community events:

- Fairmead Community and Friends Resource Fair (June 24, 2023)
- City of Madera Farmers Market (August 17, 2023, August 31, 2023 and September 7, 2023)
- Oakhurst Community Health Fair at the Oakhurst Community Center (September 22, 2023)
- La Vina Community Center (October 4, 2023)
- Fairmead Resource Fair (March 23, 2024)

~~A.4~~A.5~~Virtual~~ Community Workshops

The County held a virtual community workshop open to all county residents on December 14, 2022. The workshop was advertised in English and Spanish online via the project website, email notification, and social media, and printed mailers and flyers distributed at the venues described above. Due to the County's large geographic area with remote communities, the workshop was held virtually via Zoom to provide an opportunity for all residents to participate, and to potentially attract a higher number of residents. Live translation services for Spanish speakers were made available. Fifteen participants attended the online workshop. The workshop consisted of a presentation on the updates to the County's Housing, Safety, and Environmental Justice Elements and a discussion session. Through the open discussion session, community members had an opportunity to provide input, ask questions, and discuss the housing needs of their communities. A recording of the workshop, a copy of the PowerPoint presentation, and public input summary were made available on the project website.

Through an open discussion session, community members had an opportunity to provide input, ask questions, and discuss the housing needs of their communities. Participants also suggested organizations to contact for interviews on housing needs, and inquired on how information would be collected for the housing needs assessment and analysis of fair housing. Comments received during the community workshop included:

- Lack of access to public facilities and utilities (e.g., water infrastructure, parks, library, community center, broadband service)
- Lack of transit resources and walkability issues
- Unreliable broadband internet and technology barriers make~~s~~ public participation in engagement events difficult for the rural communities of La Vina and Fairmead
- Pollution burdens of greatest concern are exposure to pesticides in areas near agriculture, smoke from wildfires in eastern parts of Madera County, and air pollutants from illegal trash burning
- Communities in Fairmead and La Vina lack access to public facilities, such as parks and libraries, and should be prioritized for infrastructure improvements, including sidewalks, street repairs, water service, and internet connection
- Comments on the Housing Element update process, including advocating for more community engagement opportunities, and recommending in-person community meetings in La Vina and Fairmead

After submitting the draft Housing Element to the state Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) for its initial review ~~review period~~, the County held two in-person community workshops in Fairmead on June 6, 2024, and La Vina on June 19, 2024. County staff provided Spanish translation to interpret for Spanish-speaking participants. All workshop materials were translated into Spanish.

The County provided a brief overview of the Housing Element, discussed the timeline and progress to date, introduced a housing needs micro-survey that was available to fill out during the workshop, and facilitated a housing needs bubble map activity to bolster local knowledge and community needs analysis in the Housing Element. One bubble map focused on confirming if what we heard from previous outreach efforts was accurate, which helped determine the highest priority issues. Previous feedback considered is shown below. Participants generally agreed with these statements, and added the following feedback to support these claims:

Statement	Supporting Feedback
Housing should be located near essential resources.	▪ There is a lack of bus and transit services. ▪ Increase multifamily housing options that require or are in proximity to childcare, laundry, gym, and open space and walking trails. ▪ Currently, people go to Chowchilla for food, groceries or other essential resources.
More resources for people looking to own or rent.	▪ Resources for undocumented residents are needed.~~,~~ ▪ Renters need housing vouchers.~~,~~
Older homes need repairs.	▪ There is a need for cooling centers and resources for ventilation in existing houses. ▪ ~~,~~Mobile home updates are required to repair leaks, windows, and install heating and cooling systems.

Statement	Supporting Feedback
More affordable housing should be available.	▪ This was strongly agreed upon by participants. ▪ Developer incentives to improve infrastructure are needed if more homes are to be built.

The second bubble map focused on improving existing policies and programs. The two primary areas the Housing Element required more feedback on based on comments submitted during the public review period are identified below. Participants agreed with these statements, and provided the following insight:

Statement	Supporting Feedback
Areas in the County where people struggle to find housing.	▪ Everywhere ▪ Multi-generational households cannot find affordable homes to live in. ▪ Rentals are hard to find.
Accessibility to employment and essential resources.	▪ The price of gas is too expensive for commuting to work. ▪ People go to Fresno for medical care and affordable services. ▪ People prefer to live closer to work. Currently, if you are employed, you are a commuter.

~~A.5~~A.6Town Hall Meetings

County staff attended four in-person town hall meetings to further engage community groups in the Housing Element process. These meetings were intended to provide additional discussion opportunities in the Disadvantaged Communities (DACs) of Fairmead and La Vina. The town halls were held in Fairmead on July 19, 2023 and August 14, 2023, and one town hall in La Vina was held October 4, 2023.

The County presented an overview of the Housing Element, discussed the project timeline, and provided additional opportunities for feedback on the Site Inventory, fair housing issues, and housing needs. Feedback from community meetings in Fairmead and La Vina expressed a need for improvements to public infrastructure, transportation access and access to services and amenities. Feedback received during town hall meetings included:

- Lack of infrastructure in the Fairmead and La Vina areas to meet housing needs
- Concerns over the use of pesticides in residential areas surrounding agricultural uses in Fairmead and La Vina
- Lack of adequate sidewalks and walkability
- Concerns over water and sewer availability
- The need for neighborhood revitalization
- Lack of amenities and services in the La Vina area
- Lack of reliable internet access in the La Vina area

An additional town hall was organized by the County on April 4, 2024, to inform participants about the draft Housing Element public review period. Participants were also provided with a key

takeaways page which included an overview of the Housing Element sections and Madera County's housing goals.

~~A.6~~A.7 Interviews with Interested Parties

The County held two virtual meetings with interested parties on May 17 and 18, 2023, with representatives of community agencies and organizations that provide affordable housing, housing services, and serving special needs populations. The meetings consisted of a short presentation followed by a discussion session. The County met with the following interested parties:

- Sara Bosse, Madera County Public Health (May 17, 2023)
- Betsy McGovern-Garcia, Self-Help Enterprises (May 17, 2023)
- Ashley Hedemann, Habitat for Humanity, Greater Fresno Area (May 18, 2023)

Interviews with interested parties focused on opportunities and constraints to housing development and fair housing issues, including the following themes:

- Barriers to affordable housing development
- Housing needs and issues within the community
- Homelessness and special needs
- Strategies for addressing housing needs
- Strategies to further engage disadvantaged populations in the Housing Element update process

Specific issues raised during the interviews included the lack of sufficient rental units, substandard and overcrowded housing conditions, lack of farmworker housing, and the high cost to develop housing.

The County also conducted interviews with interested parties after HCD completed its review of the draft Housing Element to gather further local knowledge and context required to improve on the existing programs and policies outlined in the Housing Plan. The County met with the following organizations to gain more local context on various fair housing issues:

Visit Yosemite – September 26, 2024

- The tourism industry is affected by limited employees due to the lack of affordable, seasonal rental housing.
- Buses have not worked to transport commuters from Madera County to Yosemite, so commuters must drive far to make it to work every day.
- Homelessness is most prevalent in the Oakhurst community, specifically around the community park. There is an encampment on Highway 41 behind the Grocery Outlet, because the closest shelter is a long way from the Town Center, and folks must walk on roads with no sidewalks. Homelessness services would be well used near the Town Center.

Madera Unified School District – October 9, 2024

- The district is one of the least affluent districts in California.
- County infrastructure is a primary concern – many students walk to schools but do not have access to sidewalks. The district transports most kids via bus, but many students still end up

walking, as bus routes can take up to an hour and 15 minutes. The length of the bus routes is so long that they cannot have electric buses without having to charge halfway through the route.

- District staff have been able to find smaller, starter homes, but a lot of staff members that are looking to move into their second home cannot find affordable housing in the area the district serves. They end up buying on the outskirts of the county, including Riverstone and Fresno, which increases their commute time.

California Rural Legal Assistance (CRLA) – October 10, 2024

- The main issue CRLA covers is eviction; specifically, where rent is held by tenants trying to get housing fixed. Landlords then evict them and bring in a new tenant so they can raise the rent.
- Sites identified within the Housing Element often do not have sewer and water hookups and are not close enough to places where people can access different kinds of services, resources, or transportation.
- CRLA provided a recommendation to have jurisdictions collaborate in funding efforts, since most jurisdictions are too small to be competitive.
- Most fair housing complaints presented to CRLA come from larger families, minority races and ethnicities, and diverse sexual orientations.
- Farm workers and those that have problems with legal status do not feel comfortable filing complaints. When they do, however, most complaints are due to the conditions of housing. Most prefer to move out rather than try to fight evictions.
- A potential way the County could increase affordable housing development and the housing stock in general is by setting up an affordable housing trust account. When new upscale development comes in, there's a percentage that foes into supporting affordable housing. Developers can then tap into that fund for future affordable housing development.
- Lift stringent requirements for people experiencing homelessness to get accepted into a shelter. The only shelter that exists in the community is a private nonprofit that has certain eligibility requirements that many people experiencing homelessness are unable to meet, such as no pets allowed, length of stay restrictions, and listening to a sermon.

Madera Coalition for Community Justice (CCJ) – October 11, 2024

- To improve participation in outreach efforts throughout the county, County staff must build trust with the community.
- LGBTQ community support groups often voice their concerns that they have a distrust for the County and feel silenced. They are reluctant to get services because of the cultural disconnect.
- The main communities lacking services are La Vina and Fairmead – specifically lacking green space outside of schools and apartment complexes, and a community center for gathering.
- Many households in La Vina do not have access to stable internet connections. They either pay thousands of dollars to get an apparatus installed to get connection, or they go without it.

Equity Advisory Committee Meetings

The Equity Advisory Committee Meetings were established to provide information and seek input on the Housing, Environmental Justice, and Safety Element updates. The Committee is comprised of representatives of key organizations including the Community Action Partnership of Madera County,

Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability, and Fairmead Community and Friends. The County met with the Equity Advisory Committee on May 1, June 5, September 25, October 16, and November 6 of 2023, and January 8, March 18, and April 8 of 2024, to obtain feedback from interested parties on preliminary findings and draft strategies that could be incorporated into the Housing Element update.

Participants were encouraged to spread awareness of the Housing Element update with their respective organizations. The Equity Advisory Committee meetings on May 1, September 25, and November 6, 2023, and January 8, March 18, and April 8, 2024 focused on the Housing Element update. The May 1, 2023 meeting introduced the Housing Element, the September 25, 2023 meeting reviewed the proposed housing sites and an overview of fair housing topics, and the November 6, 2023 meeting discussed potential programs and policies. The January 8, 2024 meeting discussed opportunities to increase participation during the public review period. Meetings on March 18 and April 8, 2024 were used to gain feedback on the goals, policies, and programs drafted in the Housing Plan. The meetings on June 5 and October 16, 2023 centered on the Safety Element update and Environmental Justice Element; however, members provided valuable insight on affirmatively furthering fair housing issues and housing policy development.

During the meetings, participants discussed constraints to housing development in the county, housing and infrastructure needs, and strategies to address identified issues. The Equity Advisory Committee identified housing needs for farmworkers and families of migrant farmworkers, including the lack of affordable housing, prevalence of unpermitted housing and substandard housing, exposure to pesticides for residents near agricultural uses, and the need for more housing options and resources for farmworkers, people at risk of homelessness, low-income households, moderate-income households, and undocumented residents. Members of the Equity Advisory Committee also stated there is a need for housing in a range of sizes and types, including smaller housing units to accommodate lower-income households such as farmworkers and female-headed, single-parent households. According to the Equity Advisory Committee, homelessness is a growing issue throughout the county, with most homeless residents living in urban areas, but the county does not have enough housing and supportive services to accommodate homeless residents, especially those struggling with mental health issues. Additional needs identified by the Equity Advisory Committee include improvements that create a sense of community, including community revitalization efforts, and meaningful community engagement efforts that are adapted to the preferences and needs of the communities they are serving. Through conversations with the Equity Advisory Committee, the County established additional strategies to ensure all communities have access to Housing Element update information, including sending informational mailers sent to DACs throughout the county to inform residents about the Housing Element public review period.

The County organized an additional Equity Advisory Committee meeting on September 4, 2024, to receive further input and local context on various programs and policies that required stronger commitments and actions. The matrix below depicts the policy discussed, EAC recommendations, and whether the recommendations were implemented:

Policy/Program	EAC Recommendation	Implementation
Action 3.1 Housing Rehabilitation Program	▪ Policies should be all inclusive of undocumented residents. Existing aid and rehabilitation resources are inaccessible to many because of their immigration status. ▪ Identify what grants need to be applied for and what the timeline is like, especially due to budget constraints and new state requirements. ▪ Be more specific about who this program would impact – single-family households, people living in small studios, elderly homes, etc.	Action 3.1 has been revised to include grant funding opportunities from specific programs including CalHome, PLHA, HOME, and CDGB. The number of units that will be repaired with these grants during the planning period was increased from 16 to 64 units.
Policy 4.4	▪ Be more specific about the program and types of shelter. Would it support long term shelters? Shelters where you show up day by day? Would there be programs for rehabilitation such as helping folks build a resume? ▪ Add a timeline for implementing strategies, and add who the beneficiary of the strategy is.	Timelines for implementation strategies have been added throughout.
Action 12.6 Indoor Air Purification	▪ Ensure enough funding sources are identified before committing to a target number of homes supported through the action. ▪ Increase the number of low-income units supported through this action. ▪ More long-term projects that reduce the need for air purifiers and resolve the issue at the source should be implemented, such as creating buffer zones between agriculture and industry uses.	The number of low-income units supported through this action has increased from 300 to 400 units. Implementation strategies such as developing an urban tree management plant to support carbon sequestration and improve air quality throughout the County will support this action.
Action 13.1 Fair Housing Services	▪ Include that the County will provide all resources in both English and Spanish. ▪ Analyze unpermitted housing in the area. Ensure that the code supports undocumented residents for fair housing opportunities, such as applying for programs without a social security number. ▪ Address water supply issues before additional connections to housing take place.	An additional activity to ensure Spanish translation is provided for all fair housing resources has been added.
Action 14.4 Increase Housing for Lower- and Moderate-Income Households in Areas of High Resources	▪ Define the types of incentives noted in the action. ▪ Remove "if needed" wording, as this is definitely needed. ▪ Explore options aside from incentive programs including inclusionary zoning, especially with growth in the southwest. ▪ Include an inclusionary housing ordinance in which developers can pay in lieu fees that could be placed into an Affordable Housing Trust Fund.	"If needed" wording was removed. Incentive programs are listed, which include greater concessions on development standards, greater technical assistance and permit streamlining, and reduced development impact fees. Action 2.7 ensures that the County will conduct a feasibility study to inform the need for an Inclusionary Housing policy. A target date to adopt the policy, if determined feasible, is January 2028.
Action 14.7 Inclusion in Engagement and Outreach	▪ Define "ensuring inclusion" within the action text. ▪ A survey should be sent out to the community asking what day and times of the week work best for outreach events to increase participation and allow those who want to attend the opportunity. ▪ Ensure that Spanish speakers are always present at outreach events and try to have Mixteco translators attend as well.	Ensuring inclusion is defined to include all geographic areas and resources such as Spanish translation for Spanish-speakers. Outreach methods will also be reviewed annually through resident surveys to adjust outreach event planning and notification.

Additional feedback from the EAC included incorporating more numeric objectives that are proportionate to the County's needs (e.g., increasing the number of rehabilitated homes supported by funding to reflect the number of homes requiring rehabilitation), committing to specific dates and funding sources to ensure accountability, and creating policies that go beyond what is required for certification.

~~A.7~~A.8Surveys

~~A.7.1~~A.8.1 Housing Needs Survey

The County prepared and distributed a housing needs survey to obtain community feedback on housing needs, access to resources, and experiences with housing discrimination. The survey was made available in English and Spanish. The project website hosted the online housing needs survey from February 17 to April 30, 2023 and received seven responses during this period. To gain more input, the housing survey was re-released on the County's website from September 15, 2023 to January 18, 2024, and received five additional responses. The input provided by the participants included the following themes:

- Housing affordable to lower-income households and housing needs being met were ranked as the highest priority housing needs in the county.
- Affordable housing, repairs to older deteriorating homes, and more opportunities for home ownership were selected as the top three housing needs in the county in the next decade.
- Mid-rise (4-story) apartments, duplexes, single-story houses and condominiums, and senior housing allowing for aging in place were ranked as the most preferred type of housing in Madera County.
- Co-housing, residential care facilities for seniors/persons with disabilities, and large custom homes were ranked as the least preferred housing types in Madera County.
- The most urgent housing challenges in the county are the affordability of housing, availability of housing, and housing quality.
- According to survey participants, new housing development should occur on agricultural and vacant land on the edges of cities and unincorporated communities.
- The most needed fair housing services are landlord/tenant counseling and promoting equal access to housing choice for all residents.
- The most needed housing assistance services are down payment assistance for lower-income first time homebuyers and home repair assistance for low-income homeowners.

Most survey participants lived in a single-family home that they owned, lived with a spouse, and earned an annual household income of more than $75,000, higher than the average annual household income in Madera County ($73,543). Most survey participants responded they were not aware of fair housing rights. Other housing needs identified through the survey included housing for people with disabilities and housing for seniors. Some respondents stated they were opposed to new housing development due to concerns regarding infrastructure capacity, traffic, and water availability.

~~A.7.2~~A.8.2 Site Inventory Survey

The County also distributed a questionnaire on the Site Inventory to seek feedback on the proposed housing opportunity sites. The survey was available on the County's website from August 29, 2023 to January 31, 2024 and was advertised on Facebook, Instagram, and Twitter (now known as X). The survey was available in English and Spanish. No responses were received on the survey; however, the Site Inventory was available for review and received over 300 views on the County's website.

A.8.3 Housing Element Micro-Survey

The County distributed an additional micro-survey during the HCD review period to receive feedback on housing needs that should be further addressed in the Housing Plan. The County transitioned to micro-surveys to increase public participation, as longer surveys such as the Site Inventory and Housing Needs survey were noted by community members as too long to complete. The survey was available in both English and Spanish and was published on the website and distributed at the workshops. The project website hosted the survey from May 31, 2024, to August 21, 2024, and received four responses. Ten responses were received at the workshops. The input provided by participants yielded the following results:

- Affordable housing is the most important form of housing development.
- The top housing challenges that require the most improvement throughout the county are making homes more affordable and accessible, and rehabilitating homes.
- Although people have difficulty finding housing in all areas of the county, La Vina is a key area to focus on, as there aren't enough homes to rent or buy.
- Most Spanish speakers that took the survey do not know where to find housing resources or information on the Housing Element. A majority of participants that took the survey in English noted that they are somewhat aware of the County's housing efforts but would like to know more.

The survey questions and results for both the online and hard copy surveys are attached to this appendix.

~~A.8~~A.9Planning Commission Study Session

The County held a study session with the Planning Commission on the Housing Element update on January 3, 2023. The study session was open to the public and included a presentation on the Housing Element update process and regional housing needs allocation, and project timeline. No public comments were made.

~~A.9~~A.10 Themes In Community Outreach Input

During the community outreach process, community members provided valuable input on housing in Madera County. The comments and concerns informed the Draft Housing Element. This input has been summarized into the following themes in Table A-1 below, along with discussion on how the comments informed the Housing Element programs and actions.

Table A-1 Summary of Community Input and Responses

Comment Theme	How Comments were Addressed
There is concern over the prevalence of unpermitted housing and substandard housing	The Housing Plan includes programs that expand resources and funding for housing rehabilitation and repairs in neighborhoods with the highest percentage of substandard housing. In addition, the County will employ programs that encourage the development of farmworker housing, affordable housing, special needs housing, and supportive/transitional housing for persons experiencing homelessness will expand access to safe housing options, reducing the residents to remain in substandard and/or unpermitted housing. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 2 directs the County to monitor and support the development of affordable housing by acquiring grant funding to support affordable housing development and providing education and technical assistance to developers and interested parties. ▪ Housing Program 3 directs the County to pursue grant funding for housing rehabilitation and provide assistance for homeowners, owners of multi-family rental housing, and mobile homeowners, with a focus on vulnerable and low-income homeowners. Program 3 also directs the County to update the Municipal Code to require mandatory inspections and mitigation of hazards by landlords upon the complaint of a rental tenant. ▪ Housing Program 4 directs the County to facilitate the development of affordable housing for farmworkers, persons with disabilities, and extremely low-income households by developing incentives, securing funding, addressing infrastructure needs, and employing permit processing priority for housing for special needs households. ▪ Housing Program 5 directs the County to expand programs and services for homeless individuals by pursuing funding for homeless service providers that operate temporary, permanent, and emergency shelters, amend the Zoning Code to permit supportive housing by-right in all zones where multi-family housing is permitted, and use County funds to create supportive housing and provide services, including employing a substance use disorder counselor.
Rental housing is in need of rehabilitation	The Housing Plan includes programs to provide support for residents living in substandard housing and housing in need of maintenance or repairs. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 3 directs the County to pursue grant funding for housing rehabilitation to provide assistance to owners and property managers of multi-family rental housing, with a focus on vulnerable and low-income homeowners. Program 3 also directs the County to update the Municipal Code to require mandatory inspections and mitigation of hazards by landlords upon the complaint of a rental tenant. Action 3.1 has been updated to ensure that at least 64 low-income housing units will undergo minor home repairs through grant funding within the planning review period. ▪ Housing Program 12 directs the County to increase participation in the County's home weatherization program. Energy efficiency improvements can include sealing holes and cracks around doors, windows and pipes, which will not only reduce energy costs but also improve the livability of homes in need of repair.

Comment Theme	How Comments were Addressed
There is a desire for improved community engagement strategies that accommodate the needs of all communities	The Housing Plan includes programs to expand community engagement and increase participation in community outreach efforts, especially for historically underrepresented communities. All of the housing programs include elements of community outreach and education. In addition, several programs provide specific direction for the County to develop community outreach plans and prioritize engagement efforts for low-income residents and historically underrepresented communities. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 14 directs the County to regularly review outreach methods and adjust community engagement strategies according to community feedback. Program 14 also directs the County to improve community engagement strategies and education and increase participation from historically underrepresented communities by collaborating with community organizations and interested parties from all sectors and geographic areas. ▪ Housing Program 13 directs the County to support fair housing and education on fair housing issues and housing/public ~~resources~~resources and provide Spanish translation for all fair housing resources. The program also directs the County to partner with a fair housing provider by January 2025.
Certain communities are disproportionately burdened by pollution from pesticide use and air pollution from wildfires	Pollution exposure is not always preventable and managing pollution generally requires regional collaboration as air quality and pollution spread beyond political and geographical boundaries. Communities on the Valley Floor are disproportionately burdened by pollution, often due to closer proximity to sources of pollution. The Housing Plan includes programs that improve environmental conditions and reduce pollution exposure. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 7 directs the County to adopt the most recent edition of the California Building Code with strengthened ventilation standards to improve indoor air quality. In addition, the Site Inventory includes the rezone of 87 sites, increasing the maximum allowed density on these sites to 25 dwelling units per acre. Updated building standards in combination with rezoning will encourage new housing development with improved indoor air quality in communities that are disproportionately affected by air pollution. ▪ Housing Program 12 directs the County to support infrastructure for public transit, active transportation such as walking and biking, and environmental improvements, prioritizing areas designated as CalEnviroScreen disadvantaged communities or by TCAC as low and moderate resource areas. Implementation of alternative transportation methods and environmental improvements will reduce air pollution emissions, thereby improving overall air quality. Program 12 also directs the County to develop an urban tree management plan which encourages planting of at least 100 trees during the planning period. Urban trees will help to improve air quality and can create a buffer between agricultural land and residential uses, which can protect people from pesticide exposure by creating windbreaks and reducing pesticide drift. ▪ Housing Program 14 directs the County to prioritize public health infrastructure in Valley Floor communities by developing an air pollution, water quality, and pesticide monitoring and reduction plan for those communities.

Comment Theme	How Comments were Addressed
There is a lack of access to public amenities (parks, libraries, community centers, etc.) in certain communities, such as Fairmead and La Vina	The Housing Plan includes programs to increase access to public amenities in areas that are currently lacking, specifically targeting communities on the Valley Floor. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 1 directs the County to rezone 87 sites (480 acres) suitable to facilitate the development of at least 1,247 housing units affordable to lower-income households. The rezone program will allow the development of higher-density multifamily housing as detailed in Program 1 of the Housing Plan. All sites proposed for rezoning will be rezoned to the RUM zoning district which allows a maximum density of at least 25 dwelling units per acre. This increase in density will encourage future housing development in areas with existing and planned parks, schools, grocery stores, commercial centers, employment opportunities, and public facilities and services. ▪ Housing Program 14 directs the County to collaborate with local organizations and residents to identify opportunities for placemaking improvements, including active transportation, public art, utility infrastructure, gardens, street trees, and recreation and community facilities and programs. These efforts will target communities in the Valley Floor, including Fairmead and La Vina.
There is a lack of infrastructure improvements, including water service, sidewalks, street repairs, broadband internet access	The Housing Plan includes programs that encourage collaborative planning efforts for infrastructure improvements in areas that need them most. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 1 directs the County to coordinate regional planning for utilities and infrastructure, prioritizing services to sites that can accommodate lower-income housing, and to obtain additional funding for infrastructure improvements. ▪ Housing Program 12 directs the County to support infrastructure, including public and active transportation, curbs, gutters, planters, sidewalks, streetlights, and wheelchair ramps, targeting low- and moderate-resource areas and CalEnviroScreen disadvantaged communities. ▪ Housing Program 14 directs the County to collaborate with local organizations and residents to identify opportunities for placemaking improvements, including neighborhood serving public infrastructure such as broadband access. These efforts will target communities in the Valley Floor, including Fairmead, La Vina, Parksdale, Parkwood, and Rolling Hills.
There is a lack of access to transportation	The Housing Plan includes programs to increase access to public transportation throughout the county, focusing on creating connections between residential areas and commercial and employment centers. The following programs were informed by community input: ▪ Housing Program 7 directs the County to coordinate with the Madera County Transportation Commission, California High Speed Rail Authority, and the San Joaquin Joint Powers Authority to facilitate development and improvements, including streetscape and the circulation network in relation to the planned high speed rail station. ▪ Housing Program 12 directs the County to support infrastructure improvements for transportation, including public and active transit. The program also encourage improved access to public transit by increasing connectivity to employment, educational, and commercial hubs and residential areas throughout the county. ▪ Housing Program 14 directs the city to take measures to increase transit access to communities in the Valley Floor and engaging those communities in the planning process for infrastructure improvements.

Comment Theme	How Comments were Addressed
There is a need for additional housing and supportive services for residents experiencing and at risk of homelessness	The Housing Plan includes actions to expand resources and services for persons experiencing homelessness, including removing barriers to the development of emergency, supportive, and transitional housing. ▪ Housing Program 2 directs the County to support the production of affordable housing, prioritizing housing for very low- and low-income households, by acquiring state and federal funding for affordable housing development and providing technical assistance for affordable housing developers. New affordable housing development will expand housing opportunities for low-income households who may be at risk of homelessness. ▪ Housing Program 5 directs the County to expand programs and services for homeless individuals by pursuing funding for homeless service providers that operate temporary, permanent, and emergency shelters, amend the Zoning Code to comply with state law regarding supportive and transitional housing, and use County funds to create supportive housing and provide services, including employing a substance use disorder counselor. Program 5 also instructs the County to annually assess the County's capacity to accommodate homeless individuals
There is a need for affordable housing for farmworkers	The Housing Plan includes actions that encourage the development of farmworker housing, to increase housing opportunities for farmworkers and their families. The following program was informed by community input: ▪ Housing Plan Program 4 directs the County to coordinate with local and regional organizations and service agencies/non-profits to facilitate the development of affordable housing for farmworkers by providing financial assistance to farmworker households, working with community organizations and interested parties to identify housing needs for farmworkers, and pursuing funding opportunities for infrastructure improvements to support the development of farmworker housing.

~~A.10~~A.11 Public Review o~~O~~f t~~T~~he Draft Housing Element

Madera County's 6th Cycle Draft Housing Element was posted on the County website for a formal public review for 30 days from March 11, 2024 through April 9, 2024. Interested parties were notified of the release of the Draft Housing Element update via email, and mailers were sent to 11,000 residents in DACs throughout the county.

Printed copies of the Draft Housing Element were made available for public viewing in the following locations:

- 3rd floor of the County building
  - 200 W. 4th St., Madera, CA 93637
- Madera County Department of Social Services
  - 1626 Sunrise Ave, Madera, CA 93683
- Community Action Partnership of Madera County
  - 1225 Gill Avenue, Madera, CA 93637
- Madera County Library
  - 121 N. G Street, Madera, CA 93637
- Chowchilla Branch Library
  - 300 Kings Avenue, Chowchilla, CA 93610
- Madera Ranchos Branch Library
  - 37398 Berkshire Drive, Madera, CA 93636
- Oakhurst Library
  - 49044 Civic Circle Dr. Oakhurst 93643

During the public review period, the County received 13 comment letters and emails via the project website from individuals, stakeholders, and community organizations. The County revised the Draft Housing Element in response to the input received, where applicable. Table A-2 lists the comment themes and how the Housing Element was revised

The second draft of the Housing Element was posted for public comment from December 11, 2024 through December 18, 2024. A total of 11 comment letters and emails were received from community members during the public review period. Comments relevant to the Housing Element have been incorporated into Table A-3 below. The Housing Element includes several revisions in response to these comments, including adding a list of existing resources for financial assistance for housing and utilities in Appendix B, Housing Needs Assessment, and adding a discussion of reasons why residents may not report fair housing complaints in Appendix F, Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing. Policies, programs, objectives, and metrics in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, were reviewed and minor revisions were made to Actions 14.5 and 14.7.

Table A-2 Summary of Public Review Comments and Responses

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
There is a need for more housing, including affordable housing for lower- and moderate-income households (comments submitted via the project website)	The County acknowledges this comment stating that more housing is needed throughout the county. The programs and actions in Chapter 2, *Housing Plan*, aim to ensure adequate housing resources for all households of various income levels and special housing needs. For example, Program 1 directs the County to maintain a Site Inventory of sites suitable to meet its RHNA allocation and support the housing needs of households of all income levels during the planning period, including rezoning of sites to accommodate more lower-income housing units and zoning code amendments. The RHNA for Madera County includes 2,162 units for lower-income households and 829 units for moderate-income households. Program 2 aims to increase the production of affordable housing. In response to this comment, the County added Action 2.7, which directs the County to consider an inclusionary zoning policy, assessing the need for potential incentives that incorporate increased affordable units (including increased densities, increased height limits, reduced parking standards, and ministerial review).
Additional public participation and outreach efforts for the Draft Housing Element should be held, including in-person events in La Vina and areas without reliable broadband access (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment and to provide additional opportunities for public input, specifically from residents in DACs, the County will facilitate additional community outreach in Fairmead, Oakhurst and La Vina, during the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) review of the Draft Housing Element to ensure adequate feedback and inform the subsequent draft of the Housing Element. ~~The County intends to hold additional in-person community meetings and provide digital and printed media resources and surveys in the spring and summer of 2024, specifically targeting DACs in the county and areas with identified housing concerns, including but not limited to, Fairmead, Oakhurst, and La Vina.In response to the comment, workshops in La Vina will be heavily advertised in both English and Spanish. The locations of the additional outreach events were identified based on their geographic location and need for in-person events due to limited internet access.~~ The County held three additional in-person community workshops and published an online Housing Element micro-survey which was also distributed at in-person events during the spring and summer of 2024. Feedback from these efforts is summarized in Section A.5.
Future development's impact on groundwater/water supply should be assessed (comments submitted via the project website)	Water supply for proposed residential development is addressed in Appendix D, *Constraints* and Appendix C, *Housing Resources*. To address this comment, the analysis in Appendix C was revised with additional detail on how the County will support water, sewer, and other infrastructure to meet the needs of future development, including funding from grants and assistance from the California High Speed Rail Authority would minimize the impact of future development on water supply and ensure adequate resources for sites identified to meet the County's RHNA obligations. Additionally, Action 14.5 was revised to include actions to support the construction of a sewer system that connects Chowchilla Wastewater Treatment Plant to the Fairmead community for sewer services.

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
The Housing Element should include time-bound plans to address concerns over pollutants (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, Action 14.5 was revised to include geographic targeting for air pollution, water-quality, and pesticide monitoring. Additionally, the action timeline was revised to implement priority actions within the planning period, including an outreach plan by January 2028.
There is a need for childcare services in the county (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County added Action 4.11, which directs the County to pursue funding to support child-care services for low-income residents
There is a need for place-making efforts, services, and infrastructure improvements, including transit, speed bumps, buffer zones, street lighting, benches and shade at bus stops, electric wayfinding signs, beautification projects, street gutter maintenance. (comments submitted via the project website, letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County increased objectives and strategies for infrastructure improvements. Action 12.3 was revised to include that funding should be used for speed bumps, buffer zones, street lighting, benches and shade at bus stops, electric wayfinding signs, beautification projects, and street gutter maintenance in disadvantaged communities, with new added metrics. Additionally, Action 12.4 was revised to identify urban tree improvement objectives such as a minimum of 60 trees will be planted in Fairmead, La Vina, and Parksdale. Action 12.5 was revised to include strategies and objectives for transit connectivity, specifically to complete at least three active or public transit projects by January 2031 and to proactively seek funding from programs including Affordable Housing Sustainable Communities.
The Housing Element should include analysis on fair housing inquiries and support for enforcement and outreach (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County clarified the nature of fair housing complaints and services in the *Fair Housing Resources* section in Appendix F, *Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing.*
The Housing Element should include additional analysis of findings on local and regional patterns and trends of poverty and segregation, lawsuits, settlements, or judgements related to fair housing issues, and other relevant factors to inform identification and prioritization of fair housing issues.(letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County added analysis of the disparities in housing needs and access to opportunity in Appendix F, *Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing.* The discussion includes the current fair housing issues of special needs groups throughout the county, such as farm labor housing, persons experiencing homelessness, public investment in amenities and services in rural communities, and resources in areas of poverty, and segregation patterns. A Summary of Key Findings section was added to Appendix F, *Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing*, that includes analysis on disproportionate housing needs between residents in the Valley Floor and mountainous regions as areas.
The Housing Element should include programs and actions that assist persons experiencing homelessness in the county, specifically in response to the annual report on homelessness findings (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability	In response to the comment, Program 5 of the Housing Plan was revised to include additional actions and timelines to assist persons experiencing homelessness, and persons at risk of becoming homeless. The County revised Action 5.2 to include a timeline, guidelines, and strategies related to the Madera County Strategic Plan to Address Homelessness. The County also added Actions 5.6 and 5.7 regarding the development of a low barrier shelter and to support a safe parking program.

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
Concerns that the Site Inventory does not meet the County's RHNA goals for low-income housing units (comments submitted via the project website, letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	When a shortfall of RHNA units on existing sites is encountered, the County is obligated to rezone sufficient land with zoning suitable to accommodate the additional units. Appendix C, *Housing Resources* was revised to include additional discussion on the methods the County implemented to meet the RHNA, and clarified that the County will rezone in order to ensure adequate housing sites appropriate for lower-income housing development. The Site Inventory under current zoning indicates that 587 lower income units could be accommodated on vacant and underutilized sites that do not require rezoning. As described in Appendix C, *Housing Resources*, and Action 1.4 of the housing plan, 87 sites will be rezoned to accommodate the remaining lower income units. The County's site inventory identified adequate sites to meet the RHNA goals for housing units at all income levels.
There is a lack of multi-family housing in high resource areas, and lack of resources in areas that can accommodate low- and moderate-income housing units (comments submitted via the project website and letter from RH Community Builders, letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County revised Action 12.3 to prioritize funding for infrastructure and neighborhood improvements, including transit, in areas that are designated as low or moderate resource by the California Tax Credit Allocation Committee (TCAC).
Existing policies and programs should have concrete dates and timelines to ensure accountability (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County revised or added programs and actions throughout the Housing Plan, where applicable, to include new timelines, geographic targeting, and objective goals. Updates include benchmarks for obtaining funding, conducting public outreach efforts, and monitoring achievements to ensure the programs are effective for DACs and are implemented in a timely manner. Program 5 was revised to direct the County to adjust the metrics of the Strategic Plan to Address Homelessness to within 6 months of completing the assessment. Actions 12.1 through 12.6 of Program 12 include revised objectives to improve climate resiliency and infrastructure needs, with revised prioritization of the disadvantaged communities within Fairmead, Parksdale, Parkwood, Rolling Hills, and La Vina. Actions 14.5 and 14.6 of Program 14 were revised to include new objectives, timelines for implementation, and geographic prioritization of actions to benefit communities in need. The County also incorporated tighter deadlines for Actions 1.2, 2.7, 4.2, and 4.3 based on the priority issues voiced during the community workshops and surveys.
Air quality/ purification should be considered with existing and future housing (letter from A. Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability)	In response to this comment, the County added Action 12.6, which directs the County to apply for grant funding for indoor air quality improvement by January 2026. Additionally, grant funds received will be prioritized to equip 300 low-income households with HEPA purifiers by January 2028, with at least 75 percent of units for residents in EPA-designated Disadvantaged Communities. The County also revised Program 14.5 to implement priority actions for air pollution, water quality, and pesticide monitoring and reduction plan for Fairmead, Parksdale, Parkwood, Rolling Hills, and La Vina.

Table A-3 Summary of Public Review Comments and Responses (Revised Draft)

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
The Housing Element should provide further analysis on housing affordability and housing opportunities and assistance for extremely low-income, low-income, and special housing needs households and persons experiencing homelessness. There is a need for a more streamlined and non-discretionary approval process for affordable housing projects to facilitate development and establish an in-lieu fee to fund affordable housing (comments submitted via the project website, letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance).	Programs and actions in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, aim to expand housing opportunities for all households of various income levels and special housing needs, including extremely low-income, low-income, and special needs households and persons experiencing homelessness. For example, Actions 2.1, 2.3, 2.4 of Program 2 directs the County to partner with nonprofit housing developers to pursue grant funding and provide education and technical assistance to facilitate the development of at least 200 subsidized housing units for extremely low-, very low-, and low-income households. Action 2.7 directs the County to conduct an economic feasibility study to consider the implementation of an inclusionary zoning policy, in-lieu fee structure, and an Affordable Housing Trust Fund to facilitate the development of housing for low-income and special housing needs households. Additional actions that support the development of affordable housing opportunities for special needs households include Actions 4.1, 4.2, 4.4, 4.7, 4.8, 4.9, and 4.10. Actions 2.4, 9.1, 9.5, and 9.6 commit the County to taking various actions to create a streamlined, ministerial permitting process for affordable housing projects, including amending the Zoning Code to comply with state streamlining requirements.
Concerns that zoning and development standards are too restrictive and may hinder the development of higher-density housing, small lot housing, and emergency shelters, including design standards and requirements for setbacks, parking, and maximum density (comments submitted via the project website, letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance).	The Housing Element contains analyses of the County's development and zoning standards in Appendix D, Housing Constraints, including standards for setbacks, parking, density, and residential design. The County's development and zoning regulations allow for a variety of residential uses, including multifamily housing up to 25 units per acre, emergency shelters in three commercial and industrial zones (by-right), setbacks ranging from 3.5 to 25 feet, and lot coverage up to 80 percent. Considering the rural nature of the county, these are not a constraint to the development of housing and are comparable to other rural jurisdictions in the area. Some development standards are more stringent than in more urban jurisdictions due to the unique challenges faced in rural Madera County. For example, the Zoning Ordinance requires a minimum of two parking spaces for a two-or-more bedroom unit in a multifamily development. This reflects transportation needs of rural residents, who may be more reliant on personal vehicles to access job opportunities and services.
Concerns about the strain that new developments place on existing infrastructure, services, and the environment, particularly roads, transit, and water, sewer, and stormwater drainage systems, highlighting the need for infrastructure expansion and improvements (comments submitted via the project website, letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance, letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	The Housing Element includes analyses of the County's existing services and public infrastructure in Appendix D, Housing Constraints, and Appendix C, Housing Resources. These analyses acknowledge the County's existing services and infrastructure is limited and the need for various infrastructure improvements and/or expansion to support future housing development, especially for water and sewer services. The programs and actions in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, includes Program 8 and Actions 1.5, 1.6, 4.3, 12.3, 12.5, and 14.5 which commit the County to identifying and prioritizing Capital Improvement Projects to address infrastructure needs, updating its Infrastructure Master Plan, encouraging infill development in areas with existing infrastructure and service connections, and pursuing grant funding to implement infrastructure maintenance and expansion activities. Further analysis of environmental impacts associated with the Housing Element and future housing development will be addressed through the California Environmental Quality Act review process which will assess impacts to a broad range of environmental topics, including impacts to the County's transportation system, public services, utilities, and greenhouse gas emissions.

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
The Housing Element should include additional analysis of the previous Housing Element's programs to evaluate whether those programs are still relevant and why previous housing goals were not met (letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance).	Appendix E, Review of Past Accomplishments, reviews the progress and effectiveness of the 5th Cycle Housing Element programs and identifies which programs will be continued in the 6th Cycle Housing Element. Most programs not completed during the 5th cycle were due to limited staffing and the COVID-19 pandemic, which reduced funding and physical capacity of developers and organizations. Goals and policies in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, include programs continued from the 5th Cycle Housing Element, many of which have been revised to reflect current housing conditions and needs as well as the County's current capacity to implement such programs. The County will continue to seek funding opportunities to ensure that housing development, rehabilitation, and rental and homeowner resources discussed in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, are carried out during the 6th Cycle Housing Element.
Concern regarding the impact of short-term rentals and streamlining of accessory dwelling units on housing supply and costs and neighborhood character. There is a need for a short-term rental ordinance to regulate the growth and use of short-term rentals, particularly in the mountain areas (comments submitted via the project website, letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance, letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	Appendix D, Housing Constraints, evaluates whether short-term rentals are a potential constraint to housing development. This analysis identifies that short-term rentals (STRs) may pose a constraint, as each unit used as a STR is not available for long-term housing on the rental market and therefore decreases the overall supply of long-term housing. To address this, the Housing Element includes Action 6.7, which commits the County to further assess the impacts of STRs on housing availability and affordability, with particular emphasis on mountain communities, and if warranted to adopt an STR ordinance which may include a STR fee to fund affordable housing development.
The Housing Element should analyze existing housing conditions and costs as well as constraints to housing affordability and the construction of new housing units. There is a need for new and expanded programs to assist residents with utility costs, pest control, home rehabilitation, and protection, particularly for low-income residents (comments submitted via the project website, letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance, letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	Appendix B, Housing Needs Assessment, and Appendix D, Housing Constraints Analysis, include a comprehensive analysis of current housing conditions, housing costs and affordability, gaps in housing needs and resources, and constraints to the development of housing, The programs and actions in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, includes programs for providing financial assistance to low-income and special housing needs residents/households. Action 3.1 commits the County to providing housing rehabilitation assistance for low-income households, including seniors, farmworkers, and persons with disabilities. Through Actions 6.1, 6.4, and 11.1 the County will provide financial assistance for rental housing and homeownership opportunities. In addition, the County will implement Actions 11.2 and 11.3 to educate and expand awareness of available homebuyer assistance programs. In response to this comment, the County added a list of existing assistance programs for housing and utility costs that are available to Madera County residents in Appendix B, Housing Needs Assessment.
The Housing Element should include a more robust analysis of fair housing issues, including why residents may file fair housing complaints, existing fair housing resources and programs, patterns of integration and segregation, disparities in access to opportunities, and displacement risk. Housing program targets should be increased to address identified fair housing issues, fair housing enforcement and resources, and housing for special needs populations (letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance, letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	Appendix F, Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing (AFFH), includes a list of existing fair housing resources and analyses of patterns of segregation and integration, disparities in access to opportunities, and disproportionate housing needs, which includes displacement risk. In response to this comment, a description of reasons why residents may not report fair housing issues was added to the fair housing analysis. To address the fair housing issues identified throughout the AFFH, Chapter 2, Housing Plan includes meaningful actions with specific actions, metrics, and timelines to address these concerns. Program 13 directs the County to contract with a fair housing provider to provide fair housing resources, conduct fair housing testing, and further analyze and identify fair housing issues by publishing a County Analysis of Impediments. In addition, Program 14 outlines a

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
	number of actions the County will take to overcome patterns of segregation and address disparities in housing needs and access to opportunity, including expanding fair housing education activities, implementing programs to address air quality, water quality, and pollution exposure, implementing place-based infrastructure such as expanded transit and infrastructure services in communities in need, and expanding public outreach efforts.
The Housing Element should include programs to facilitate a robust community outreach program that establishes partnerships with trusted community-based organizations (CBOs) and community leaders. Outreach efforts should use diverse media outlets, and include in-person events, public discussions, and translation services (letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	The County acknowledges this comment stating that more outreach should be done to establish trusted partnerships and inform the community of housing efforts. In response to this comment, Action 14.7 of Program 14 was revised to specify that translation services will be provided for all outreach activities related to the housing programs and plans and that the County will assess changes in translation service needs as part of the annual review of outreach methods. Programs and policies in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, were designed based on community outreach completed during the drafting of the Housing Element. The County created an engagement plan which included virtual and in person workshops and pop-up events, an online informational website, online and in-person surveys, ~~stakeholde~~interested party~~r~~ interviews, collaboration with County libraries to distribute the Housing Element for public review and advertise public workshops. Additionally, the County established a Community Advisory Committee which met once a month to discuss housing issues, drafted policies and programs, and methods to further involve the community in the process. The County also drafted outreach and enforcement policies and programs to ensure all regions of the County are notified and included in the Housing Element process for the next cycle. Housing Element notifications and outreach efforts have all been made available in both English and Spanish. The Housing Element includes Actions 14.1, 14.2, and 14.7 to support fair housing education and inform residents of housing resources. Spanish translation will also be provided for future outreach materials and events.
The Housing Element should include more analysis as well as programs to address disproportionate pollution burden, including air pollution from pesticide application, freeways, and agricultural and industrial uses. Housing programs should also address high water rates, unprescribed burnings, and trash removal (letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	In response to this comment, Action 14.5 of Program 14 was revised to commit the County to initiating discussions collaborative discussions with the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, operators of agricultural and industrial uses in close proximity to residential uses, and community representatives to address air quality issues. The Housing Element also includes Program 12 in Chapter 2, Housing Plan, which address disparities in pollution exposure and poor air quality, inform the community of weatherization programs and health resources, support public clean energy, public health, and public transit opportunities, and establish relationships between water supply entities to improve clean water access throughout the County. These issues are addressed further in the County's Environmental Justice Element and Safety Element. The Environmental Justice Element includes policies and programs addressing pollution burden, public facilities access, food access, safe and sanitary homes, physical activity and health, and community engagement. The Safety Element also includes programs to address exposure to exposure to air pollution, pesticides, and hazardous materials from agricultural and industrial land uses.

Comment Theme	How Comment was Addressed
Recommendation to review Housing Action objectives and increase targets to meet identified housing needs. The Housing Element should also specify how and when housing policies will be implemented (letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance, letter from U. Uribe and J. Tilgren, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability).	Housing Element policies, programs, objectives, and metrics have been designed to address identified housing needs within the context of a rural county. Chapter 2, Housing Plan, outlines specific actions the County will undertake to implement Housing Element policies, including measurable metrics and target dates for completing each action.
Need to update analyses throughout the Housing Element to reflect more recent data, including updated American Community Survey data. (letter from B. Moy, California Rural Legal Assistance).	The Housing Element includes data from various sources, some of which provide updated data on an annual basis. In some instances, analyses within the Housing Element are updated to reflect more recent data if significant changes to housing or socioeconomic conditions are indicated. However, due to the extensive process of drafting and revising the Housing Element, much of the data is not revised as updated data is released, as this would be a lengthy process and the conclusions of these analyses would remain likely unchanged. By the time the Housing Element is adopted and certified some of the data used in the analysis may be several years old. To address ongoing changes and growth throughout the County, housing programs included in the Housing Element incorporate actions for continued analysis of housing conditions and needs as well as adjustments to housing programs to address these changes.

A.11 Additional Outreach Opportunities

The County recognizes the importance of community outreach for understanding the community's needs and creating effective policies and programs. In response to feedback from community organizations regarding the need for additional input from the community, the County will conduct additional outreach opportunities to inform subsequent drafts of the Housing Element.

The County intends to hold additional in-person community meetings and provide digital and printed media resources and surveys in the spring and summer of 2024, specifically targeting DACs in the county and areas with identified housing concerns, including Fairmead, Oakhurst, and La Vina. Input from this outreach will be considered and incorporated into the revised Draft Housing Element and programs as needed. The revised drafts, including information on the additional public participation efforts, will be available for public review prior to adoption by the Board of Supervisors and subsequent HCD review.